

STATE OF WISCONSIN Department of Employee Trust Funds

Robert J. Conlin SECRETARY 801 W Badger Road PO Box 7931 Madison WI 53707-7931

1-877-533-5020 (toll free) Fax (608) 267-4549 http://etf.wi.gov

CORRESPONDENCE MEMORANDUM

DATE: April 24, 2012

TO: Group Insurance Board

- **FROM:** Lisa Ellinger, Administrator Division of Insurance Services
- **SUBJECT:** Acceptance of State and Local Income Continuation Insurance Actuarial Valuations

Staff requests the Group Insurance Board (Board) approve both the state and local Income Continuation Insurance Plan Actuarial Reviews as of December 31, 2011.

The Board's consulting actuary, Deloitte Consulting LLP, does not recommend a change in premium for the state plan for 2013. However, Deloitte does anticipate the need to implement a 9% premium rate increase in 2014 and 2016. Premium contributions totaled \$13.7 million in 2011; the recommended 9% increase would generate an additional \$1.2 million in 2014.

Deloitte recommends the continuation of the premium holiday for the local plan.

A brief summary is found on page one of each report.

Staff will be available at the May 22, 2012, Board meeting to answer any questions you may have.

Attachments:

State Income Continuation Insurance Actuarial Valuations Local Income Continuation Insurance Actuarial Valuations

| | · . |
|--------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| Reviewed and approved by Rober | t J. Marchant, Deputy Secretary |
| IL Jes | 4-30-12 |
| Signature C | Date |
| | |

| Board | Mtg Date | Item # |
|-------|----------|--------|
| GIB | 5.22.12 | 6 |

Deloitte.

State of Wisconsin



State Income Continuation Insurance Plan Actuarial Review as of December 31, 2011

Audit.Tax.Consulting.Financial Advisory.

Prepared By: Timothy D. Gustafson, FSA, MAAA Deloitte Consulting LLP

Table of Contents

| I. | Overview | 1 |
|------|--|--------|
| II. | 2011 Experience Review | 2 |
| III. | Estimated Liability as of December 31, 2011 | 4 |
| IV. | Analysis of Funding Levels | 6 |
| | bit 1: Summary of Actuarial Assumptions bit 2: Reported Claim Liability by Year of Disability | 7 8 |

I. Overview

The purpose of this report is to summarize our review of the State Income Continuation Insurance Plan. Included are a brief review of the Plan's experience during 2011, an estimate of the State's liability as of December 31, 2011, and an analysis of current funding levels.

In preparing this report, we have relied on claim information provided by Aetna and the Department of Employee Trust Funds ("ETF"). We have not audited this information, but have relied on it as submitted after making reasonableness checks and recommended corrections to Aetna as we deemed appropriate under the circumstances.

The results of this review indicate that the State Income Continuation Insurance Plan (including supplemental benefits) has assets of \$54.4 million and estimated liabilities of \$83.3 million as of December 31, 2011. The asset balance does not include \$3.7 million in deferred market losses which will be smoothed in over the next four years. We note that the deferred market losses listed here and as used in our financial projections are draft amounts provided by ETF due to the timing of our reports and the finalization of the deferred amounts. The net fund balance is \$(28.9) million. This net fund balance represents approximately (34.7)% of liabilities. Traditionally, a long-term objective of maintaining a net fund balance of 15% to 25% of estimated liabilities has been considered reasonable.

Premiums were reinstated for this plan on August 1, 1996. These premiums stabilized the funded status of the plan from 2000 through 2004. Since 2005, the net fund balance has been negative. Despite 7% increases in premium revenue that took effect February 1, 2007, January 1, 2010 and January 1, 2012, the funded status of the plan has continued to deteriorate. The funded status of the plan has not been in the targeted range since 2004.

In 2011, plan assets decreased by 8.2% while estimated liabilities increased 18.8%. This resulted in contiunued erosion of the plan's annual net fund balance, as it declined from (15.5)% of liabilities in 2010 to (34.7)% of liabilities in 2011. In 2010 we anticipated that additional 7% premium rate increases would be needed in 2014 and 2016 to return the net fund balance to target levels. However, as a result of the worsening funded status of the plan in 2011, we now anctipate the need to impliment a 9% increase to plan premium in 2014 and 2016. As a result of the 2012 premium rate increase, we do not recommend any change in premium rates for 2013. Additional future premium increases may be needed in order to offset the continued deteriation of the net fund balance. We will continue to monitor the plan's net funding balance and need for further rate increases.

The remainder of this report summarizes the review in more detail. A number of assumptions have been made in estimating the State's liability, which are described throughout the report and summarized in Exhibit 1.

II. 2011 Experience Review

Fund Balance

During 2011, the fund balance decreased from \$59,219,088 to \$54,368,602. Total revenues were \$14,592,776 with paid claims and administrative expenses totaling \$19,388,207. As shown below, contributions and investment earnings decreased by approximately \$0.4 and \$1.9 million, respectively, resulting in a 14% decrease in total revenue. The components of the cash flows are shown in the following table along with figures for the previous three years for comparison purposes. The Net Ending Balance does not include \$3.7 million in deferred market losses which will be smoothed in over the next four years.

| | 2011 | 2010 | 2009 | 2008 |
|----------------------------|--------------|--------------|-------------|--------------|
| Beginning Balance | 59,219,088 | 59,367,041 | 60,358,843 | 62,022,782 |
| Closing Adjustments | (105,055) | (24,781) | (14,813) | 719,743 |
| Adjusted Beginning Balance | 59,114,033 | 59,342,260 | 60,344,030 | 62,742,525 |
| Revenues | | | | |
| Contributions | 13,687,699 | 14,081,359 | 13,028,086 | 12,327,669 |
| Investment Earnings | 905,077 | 2,839,973 | 2,537,632 | 1,838,355 |
| Total | 14,592,776 | 16,921,332 | 15,565,718 | 14,166,024 |
| Expenses | | | | |
| Paid Claims | 17,517,513 | 15,180,515 | 14,853,486 | 14,335,283 |
| Administrative Expenses | 1,820,694 | 1,863,988 | 1,689,220 | 2,214,424 |
| Total | 19,338,207 | 17,044,504 | 16,542,707 | 16,549,706 |
| | | | | |
| Net Income | (4,745,431) | (123,172) | (976,989) | (2,383,682) |
| | | | | |
| Ending Balance | 54,368,602 | 59,219,088 | 59,367,041 | 60,358,843 |
| | | | | |
| Estimated Liability | 83,256,262 | 70,099,863 | 68,936,151 | 72,801,768 |
| | · · · | | | |
| Net Fund Balance | (28,887,659) | (10,880,775) | (9,569,110) | (12,442,925) |
| | | | | |
| Investment Earnings/Mean | 1.00/ | 4.9% | 4.3% | 2.00/ |
| Ending Balance | 1.6% | 4.9% | 4.3% | 3.0% |

As of December 31, 2011, there were 1,170 open claims. During 2011, 1,381 claims were closed. Total reported claims incurred during 2011 were 2,551. The following table shows the number of open and closed claims by year incurred and the average net monthly benefit.

| | Open Claims | | Closed Claims | | All Claims | |
|--------------|-------------|-------------|---------------|-------------|------------|-------------|
| Year | | Average | | Average | | Average |
| Incurred | Number | Net Benefit | Number | Net Benefit | Number | Net Benefit |
| 2011 | 357 | \$ 2,303 | 798 | \$ 2,601 | 1,155 | \$ 2,509 |
| 2010 | 135 | 1,661 | 493 | 2,124 | 628 | 2,025 |
| 2009 | 95 | 994 | 27 | 1,160 | 122 | 1,030 |
| 2008 | 74 | 789 | 11 | 933 | 85 | 808 |
| 2007 | 66 | 880 | 6 | 619 | 72 | 859 |
| 2006 | 62 | 707 | 6 | 538 | 68 | 692 |
| 2005 | 66 | 850 | 4 | 1,165 | 70 | 868 |
| 2004 | 50 | 641 | 8 | 693 | 58 | 648 |
| 2003 | 34 | 589 | 1 | 425 | 35 | 584 |
| 2002 | 40 | 773 | 4 | 717 | 44 | 768 |
| 2001 | 25 | 738 | 2 | 657 | 27 | 732 |
| 2000 | 26 | 569 | 2 | 556 | 28 | 568 |
| 1999 | 23 | 796 | 2 | 309 | 25 | 757 |
| 1998 | 19 | 592 | 3 | 791 | 22 | 619 |
| 1997 | 11 | 685 | 3 | 772 | 14 | 703 |
| 1996 | 19 | 679 | 2 | 298 | 21 | 643 |
| 1995 | 9 | 933 | 3 | 586 | 12 | 846 |
| 1994 | 11 | 686 | 2 | 146 | 13 | 603 |
| 1993 & Prior | 48 | 829 | 4 | 1,028 | 52 | 845 |
| Total | 1,170 | \$ 1,350 | 1,381 | \$ 2,317 | 2,551 | \$ 1,873 |

Claims By Year of Incurral

The number of open claims and their respective average net benefit amounts in 2011 increased compared to last year. The number of closed claims and their respective average net benefit amounts in 2011 increased compared to last year. The following table shows this comparison for the last ten years.

Claims By Valuation Date

| | Open Claims | | Closed | Closed Claims | | laims |
|------|-------------|-------------|--------|---------------|--------|-------------|
| Plan | | Average | | Average | | Average |
| Year | Number | Net Benefit | Number | Net Benefit | Number | Net Benefit |
| 2011 | 1,170 | \$ 1,350 | 1,381 | \$ 2,317 | 2,551 | \$ 1,873 |
| 2010 | 1,067 | 1,231 | 1,372 | 2,237 | 2,439 | 1,797 |
| 2009 | 1,124 | 1,264 | 1,189 | 2,306 | 2,313 | 1,799 |
| 2008 | 1,130 | 1,325 | 1,440 | 2,160 | 2,570 | 1,793 |
| 2007 | 1,064 | 1,128 | 1,412 | 997 | 2,476 | 1,065 |
| 2006 | 1,123 | 1,146 | 1,295 | 881 | 2,418 | 1,004 |
| 2005 | 1,054 | 1,211 | 1,215 | 1,009 | 2,269 | 1,103 |
| 2004 | 972 | 1,168 | 1,205 | 1,042 | 2,177 | 1,098 |
| 2003 | 876 | 1,255 | 1,148 | 1,261 | 2,024 | 1,258 |
| 2002 | 895 | 1,042 | 1,086 | 1,012 | 1,981 | 1,025 |

III. Estimated Liability as of December 31, 2011

The State's liability for outstanding claims under the State Income Continuation Insurance Plan was estimated in two parts — reported claims and incurred but unreported claims. The following paragraphs summarize the method used and results.

Reported Claims

Disabled life reserve factors were calculated using the 1987 Commissioner's Group Basic Disability table adjusted for the State of Wisconsin's own termination experience. These factors represent the present value of future payments, at 7.2% interest, to a disabled person with a monthly benefit of \$1.00. In 2010, the Employee Trust Funds Board reduced the investment return assumption relied upon by the Wisconsin Retirement System ("WRS") from 7.8% to 7.2%, which has since remained at 7.2%. For consistency and per the direction of ETF personnel, the valuation interest rate is tied to the WRS valuation rate; therefore a 7.2% discount rate was used for the December 31, 2011, valuation. The factors are indexed by age at disablement, duration of disablement, and duration to the end of the benefit period.

Aetna provided a listing of those persons known to be disabled as of December 31, 2011. The age at disablement, duration of disability and benefit end date, based on the maximum allowable duration of benefits under the plan, was calculated for each individual. The appropriate factors were then multiplied by the amount of benefit for each disabled person. The results were summarized by year incurred and in total.

For disabilities that last over one year, an additional \$75 per month is included in the normal benefit amount for the purpose of defraying medical costs. This supplemental benefit was effective January 1, 2002, for all claims in pay status. A liability was added for those claims incurred in 2011 representing the probability that claims will continue beyond the first year and the present value of the additional benefit. The liability for the \$75 supplement is already included in the liability for claims over one year in duration.

Incurred But Unreported Claims

In addition to those claims reported as of December 31, 2011, there presumably are other claims incurred prior to that date but which are not yet reported. The State's liability for long-term disability claims begins on the date an employee is disabled, even though the employee is not eligible for payments during the waiting period or has not yet filed a claim. Thus, an estimate of the additional liability for claims incurred but not reported as of the valuation date is necessary.

Besides the waiting period, delays in the reporting and processing of claims normally occur. From the State's own experience, we observed that on average approximately 14% of claims open and closed during the previous twelve months are unreported as of year end. Thus, the State's liability for claims incurred but not yet reported was calculated as the estimated number of incurred but not yet reported claims times an average benefit amount times an average disabled life reserve factor.

Results

The total estimated liability as of December 31, 2011, for the State Income Continuation Insurance Plan is \$83,256,262, developed as follows:

| Reported Claim Liability | \$71,632,393 |
|-------------------------------------|--------------|
| <u>\$75 Supplement</u> | 615,770 |
| Total Reported Liability | 72,248,163 |
| Incurred But Not Reported Liability | 11,008,099 |
| Total Liability | \$83,256,262 |

When compared to their respective liabilities as of December 31, 2010, the December 31, 2011 total reported claim liability increased 19.3%, while the incurred but not reported liability increased 15.5%. The increase in the reported liability is due to the combined effect of a 9.7% increase in the count of open claims and a change in the composition and characteristics of the average claimant in the open claim cohort. The increase in the incurred but not reported liability is primarily due to an increase in the number of new claims incurred during the valuation year. As a result, the total liability is 18.8% more than the liability determined as of December 31, 2010.

Exhibit 2 contains a breakdown of the \$72,248,163 reported liability by year of disability.

IV. Analysis of Funding Levels

The State Income Continuation Insurance Plan has assets of \$54.4 million and estimated liabilities of \$83.3 million, producing a net fund balance of \$(28.9) million. The collected premiums covered just less than 71% of paid claims and administrative expenses, while investment earnings covered just less than 5% of the paid claims and administrative expense balance. Thus, cash flow in the trust was negative this year. Cumulative cash flows for plan years 2007 through 2011 are \$(6,882,152).

Considerable year-to-year fluctuations can occur under disability income plans, even for a plan as large as that of the State. Thus, maintaining a fund balance in excess of estimated liabilities is prudent. A reasonable long-term objective has been to maintain an asset balance of 115% to 125% of estimated liabilities as a hedge against future adverse experience. The current asset balance covers 65.3% of liabilities (as compared to 84.5% last year). The net fund balance is not in the targeted range for the sixth consecutive year. The annual net fund balances (as a percentage of liabilities) were (1.5)% in 2005, (9.4)% in 2006, (4.3)% in 2007, (17.1)% in 2008, (13.9)% in 2009, and (15.5)% in 2010.

Despite an increase in premium revenue of approximately 7% that took effect February 1, 2007, the funded status of the plan has deteriorated over time. Although the premium increase led to a slight improvement in the net fund balance from 2006 to 2007, the net fund balance decreased in 2008 due to a 12% increase in liabilities and poor asset yield experience. As a result of the worsening funded status of the plan in 2008, a 7% premium increase was implemented for plan year 2010. Additionally, we projected that additional future 7% premium increases would likely be necessary to return the net fund balance to target levels over the longer term. In 2010, plan assets saw a decrease, while estimated liabilities of the plan grew, leading to a decline in the plan's annual net fund balance. As a result of the worsening funded status of the plan in 2010, a 7% premium increase was implemented for plan year 2012.

In 2011, plan assets decreased by 8.2% while estimated liabilities increased 18.8%. This resulted in contiunued erosion of the plan's annual net fund balance, as it declined from (15.5)% of liabilities in 2010 to (34.7)% of liabilities in 2011. In 2010 we anticipated that additional 7% premium rate increases would be needed in 2014 and 2016 to return the net fund balance to target levels. However, as a result of the worsening funded status of the plan in 2011, we now anctipate the need to impliment a 9% increase to plan premium in 2014 and 2016. As a result of the 2012 premium rate increase, we do not recommend any change in premium rates for 2013. For consistency with prior premium increases and per the direction of ETF personnel, we are following a bi-annual premium rate increase schedule.

Since 2005, the cash flow in the trust has been negative for all years except 2007, implying the total paid claims and administrative expense balance has exceeded the collected premiums and investment earnings of the plan. Relative to their respective 2010 levels, investment earnings decreased 68% and collected premium decreased 3%, resulting in total revenues decreasing just less than 14% in 2011. ETF amortizes investment gains and losses over a 5 year period. The decrease in investment earnings in 2011 is the result of recognition of large prior years' losses and the portion of the 2011 loss amortized in 2011. Relative to their respective 2011 levels, paid claims increased 15% and administrative expenses decreased 2%, resulting in total expenses increasing approximately 13% in 2011. The increase in paid claims is due to an increase both in the number of open claims as well as the average net benefit per open claim relative to 2010 levels.

If actual investment earnings continue to come in below projections and actual paid claims continue to come in above projections, continued increases to premiums will be necessary to achieve a positive net fund balance. Based on current financial projections, we anticipate that additional 9% premium increases for future plan years will likely be nessessary in order to return the net fund balance to target levels over the longer term. As future asset and liability experience emerges, we will continue to evaluate the need for the future additional premium increases.

Exhibit 1– Summary of Actuarial Assumptions

Elimination Period — 90 days average. Actual waiting period varies with accumulated sick leave and for University faculty, the elimination period selected.

| Age at Disablement | Maximum Duration of Benefits in Years |
|-----------------------|--|
| 61 or Younger | To age 65 |
| 62 | 3.50 years |
| 63 | 3.00 years |
| 64 | 2.50 years |
| 65 | 2.00 years |
| 66 | 1.75 years |
| 67 | 1.50 years |
| 68 | 1.25 years |
| 69 | 1.00 years |

Benefit Period — The maximum duration of benefits for disabled insured employees is:

In no event are benefits payable beyond the 70th birthday.

Termination Rates — Deloitte Consulting completed a claim termination rate experience study using WRS disability program claims experience for claims incurred 5/13/2006 – 12/31/2010. The results of the claim termination rate study supported a reduction in the termination rate adjustment factor for the first and second year of disablement (from 280% and 260%, respectively). The percentage of the 1987 Commissioner's Basic Disability Table three month elimination period termination rates based on the State of Wisconsin's own experience are shown below:

| Duration of Disablement | Termination Rate Adjustment |
|----------------------------|--------------------------------|
| First Year | 250% |
| Second Year | 250% |
| Third Year | 240% |
| Fourth Year | 220% |
| Fifth Year | 200% |
| Sixth Year | 180% |
| Seventh Year | 160% |
| Eighth Year | 140% |
| Ninth Year | 120% |
| Tenth Year & Later | 100% |

Interest — 7.2% per year.

Contingency Margins — None.

Exhibit 2: Reported Claim Liability by Year of Disability

| Year of | | Gross | Offset | Net | Estimated | 75 | Ave. | Est'd |
|------------|-------|-------------|-------------|-------------|--------------|-----------|---------|--------------|
| Disability | Count | Benefit \$ | Amount \$ | Benefit \$ | Liability \$ | Supp \$ | Ben \$ | Liability \$ |
| 2011 | 357 | \$960,107 | \$137,821 | \$822,287 | \$22,218,584 | \$615,770 | \$2,303 | \$22,834,354 |
| 2010 | 135 | 392,711 | 168,484 | 224,227 | 11,180,320 | 0 | 1,661 | 11,180,320 |
| 2009 | 95 | 284,386 | 190,002 | 94,384 | 6,020,135 | 0 | 994 | 6,020,135 |
| 2008 | 74 | 228,863 | 170,449 | 58,414 | 4,025,685 | 0 | 789 | 4,025,685 |
| 2007 | 66 | 181,595 | 123,495 | 58,100 | 4,593,645 | 0 | 880 | 4,593,645 |
| 2006 | 62 | 155,650 | 111,818 | 43,832 | 3,808,773 | 0 | 707 | 3,808,773 |
| 2005 | 66 | 161,686 | 105,617 | 56,070 | 4,443,219 | 0 | 850 | 4,443,219 |
| 2004 | 50 | 111,249 | 79,200 | 32,050 | 2,750,219 | 0 | 641 | 2,750,219 |
| 2003 | 34 | 75,000 | 54,990 | 20,010 | 1,787,383 | 0 | 589 | 1,787,383 |
| 2002 | 40 | 88,551 | 57,629 | 30,922 | 1,972,676 | 0 | 773 | 1,972,676 |
| 2001 | 25 | 52,004 | 33,553 | 18,451 | 1,442,934 | 0 | 738 | 1,442,934 |
| 2000 | 26 | 49,311 | 34,506 | 14,805 | 794,825 | 0 | 569 | 794,825 |
| 1999 | 23 | 54,356 | 36,048 | 18,308 | 1,292,085 | 0 | 796 | 1,292,085 |
| 1998 | 19 | 41,630 | 30,376 | 11,254 | 579,390 | 0 | 592 | 579,390 |
| 1997 | 11 | 20,314 | 12,784 | 7,531 | 475,398 | 0 | 685 | 475,398 |
| 1996 | 19 | 32,563 | 19,661 | 12,902 | 845,714 | 0 | 679 | 845,714 |
| 1995 | 9 | 14,395 | 5,994 | 8,401 | 480,410 | 0 | 933 | 480,410 |
| 1994 | 11 | 18,930 | 11,383 | 7,547 | 468,120 | 0 | 686 | 468,120 |
| 1993 | 7 | 12,572 | 7,957 | 4,615 | 300,046 | 0 | 659 | 300,046 |
| 1992 | 6 | 8,955 | 3,769 | 5,186 | 327,870 | 0 | 864 | 327,870 |
| 1991 | 7 | 11,645 | 2,804 | 8,841 | 626,736 | 0 | 1,263 | 626,736 |
| 1990 | 7 | 9,096 | 4,037 | 5,059 | 266,298 | 0 | 723 | 266,298 |
| 1989 | 6 | 8,019 | 3,691 | 4,328 | 212,479 | 0 | 721 | 212,479 |
| 1988 | 6 | 9,975 | 3,630 | 6,344 | 372,026 | 0 | 1,057 | 372,026 |
| 1987 | 2 | 2,212 | 935 | 1,277 | 77,155 | 0 | 638 | 77,155 |
| 1986 | 1 | 1,161 | 527 | 634 | 29,977 | 0 | 634 | 29,977 |
| 1984 | 2 | 2,023 | 1,046 | 977 | 77,869 | 0 | 488 | 77,869 |
| 1983 | 2 | 2,153 | 431 | 1,722 | 106,054 | 0 | 861 | 106,054 |
| 1982 | 1 | 825 | 416 | 409 | 33,992 | 0 | 409 | 33,992 |
| 1980 | 1 | 727 | 308 | 419 | 22,373 | 0 | 419 | 22,373 |
| Total | 1,170 | \$2,992,664 | \$1,413,362 | \$1,579,302 | \$71,632,393 | \$615,770 | \$1,350 | \$72,248,163 |

Open Claims as of December 31, 2011



Deloitte Consulting LLP 111 S Wacker Dr Chicago, IL 60606 United States

Tel: 312 486 2265 Fax: 312 486 2265 www.deloitte.com

About Deloitte

Deloitte refers to one or more of Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu Limited, a UK private company limited by guarantee, and its network of member firms, each of which is a legally separate and independent entity. Please see www.deloitte.com/about for a detailed description of the legal structure of Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu Limited and its member firms. Please see www.deloitte.com/us/about for a detailed description of the legal structure of Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu Limited and its member firms. Please see www.deloitte.com/us/about for a detailed description of the legal structure of Deloitte LLP and its subsidiaries. Certain services may not be available to attest clients under the rules and regulations of public accounting.

Copyright O 2012 Deloitte Development LLC. All rights reserved. Member of Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu Limited



State of Wisconsin



Local Income Continuation Insurance Plan Actuarial Review as of December 31, 2011

> Prepared By: Timothy D. Gustafson, FSA, MAAA Deloitte Consulting LLP

Audit.Tax.Consulting.Financial Advisory.

Table of Contents

| I. | Overview | 1 |
|------|--|--------|
| II. | 2011 Experience Review | 2 |
| III. | Estimated Liability as of December 31, 2011 | 4 |
| IV. | Analysis of Funding Levels | 6 |
| | ibit 1: Summary of Actuarial Assumptions ibit 2: Reported Claim Liability by Year of Disability | 7 8 |

I. Overview

The purpose of this report is to summarize our review of the Local Income Continuation Insurance Plan. Included are a brief review of the Plan's experience during 2011, an estimate of the Plan's liability as of December 31, 2011, and an analysis of current funding levels.

In preparing this report, we have relied on claim information provided by Aetna and the Department of Employee Trust Funds ("ETF"). We have not audited this information, but have relied on it as submitted after making reasonableness checks as we deemed appropriate under the circumstances.

The results of this review indicate that the Local Income Continuation Insurance Plan (including supplemental benefits) is in a strong financial position, with assets of \$31.8 million and estimated liabilities of \$4.9 million. The asset balance does not include \$2.1 million in deferred market losses which will be smoothed in over the next four years. We note that the deferred market losses listed here and as used in our financial projections are draft amounts provided by ETF due to the timing of our reports and the finalization of the deferred amounts.

In 2011, plan assets increased by 4.3%, while estimated liabilities increased 22.3%. This resulted in the plan's annual net fund balance decreasing from 663% of liabilities in 2010 to 551% of liabilities in 2011. As a result of the continued positive funded status of the plan, we recommend contributions not be reinstated at this time.

The remainder of this report summarizes the review in more detail. A number of assumptions have been made in estimating the Plan's liability. These assumptions are described throughout the report and summarized in Exhibit 1.

II. 2011 Experience Review

Fund Balance

During 2011, the fund balance increased from \$30,457,781 to \$31,777,793. Total revenues were \$2,389,720 with paid claims and administrative expenses totaling \$1,017,157. These components are shown in the following table along with figures for the previous three years for comparison purposes. The Net Ending Balance does not include \$2.1 million in deferred market losses which will be smoothed in over the next four years.

| | 2011 | 2010 | 2009 | 2008 |
|--|------------|------------|------------|------------|
| Beginning Balance | 30,457,781 | 28,097,196 | 25,871,414 | 24,150,025 |
| Closing Adjustments | (52,551) | (11,837) | 47,498 | (27,755) |
| Adjusted Beginning Balance | 30,405,230 | 28,085,359 | 25,918,912 | 24,122,270 |
| Revenues | | | | |
| Contributions | 1,926,819 | 1,898,818 | 1,839,354 | 1,716,186 |
| Investment Earnings | 462,901 | 1,374,714 | 1,114,527 | 778,089 |
| Total | 2,389,720 | 3,273,533 | 2,953,881 | 2,494,275 |
| Expenses | | | | |
| Paid Claims | 890,905 | 764,408 | 644,811 | 594,077 |
| Administrative Expenses | 126,252 | 136,702 | 130,787 | 151,054 |
| Total | 1,017,157 | 901,111 | 775,597 | 745,131 |
| | | | | |
| Net Income | 1,372,563 | 2,372,422 | 2,178,284 | 1,749,144 |
| | | | | |
| Ending Balance | 31,777,793 | 30,457,781 | 28,097,196 | 25,871,414 |
| | | | | |
| Estimated Liability | 4,882,791 | 3,992,238 | 3,840,102 | 3,886,827 |
| · · · · · · | | | | |
| Net Fund Balance | 26,895,001 | 26,465,543 | 24,257,094 | 21,984,587 |
| | | • • | • • | |
| Investment Earnings/Mean Ending Balance | 1.5% | 4.8% | 4.2% | 3.2% |

The following table shows the number of open and closed claims by year incurred and the average net monthly benefit.

| | Open | Claims | Closed | Claims | All Claims | | |
|----------|--------|----------|--------|----------|------------|----------|--|
| Year | | Average | _ | Average | _ | Average | |
| Incurred | Number | Benefit | Number | Benefit | Number | Benefit | |
| 2011 | 20 | \$ 1,880 | 40 | \$ 2,653 | 60 | \$ 2,395 | |
| 2010 | 9 | 1,862 | 36 | 1,918 | 45 | 1,906 | |
| 2009 | 6 | 1,423 | 0 | - | 6 | 1,423 | |
| 2008 | 2 | 1,050 | 1 | 913 | 3 | 1,004 | |
| 2007 | 0 | - | 0 | - | 0 | - | |
| 2006 | 2 | 524 | 1 | 1,066 | 3 | 705 | |
| 2005 | 6 | 334 | 0 | - | 6 | 334 | |
| 2004 | 5 | 896 | 0 | - | 5 | 896 | |
| 2003 | 4 | 1,134 | 0 | - | 4 | 1,134 | |
| 2002 | 2 | 1,070 | 0 | - | 2 | 1,070 | |
| 2001 | 0 | - | 0 | - | 0 | - | |
| 2000 | 2 | 489 | 0 | - | 2 | 489 | |
| 1999 | 0 | - | 0 | - | 0 | - | |
| 1998 | 0 | - | 0 | - | 0 | - | |
| 1997 | 1 | 992 | 0 | - | 1 | 992 | |
| 1996 | 1 | 163 | 0 | - | 1 | 163 | |
| 1995 | 0 | - | 0 | - | 0 | - | |
| 1994 | 0 | - | 0 | - | 0 | - | |
| 1993 | 0 | - | 1 | 389 | 1 | 389 | |
| Total | 60 | \$ 1,356 | 79 | \$ 2,247 | 139 | \$ 1,862 | |

Claims By Year of Incurral

The following table shows the claim count and average net benefit amount for open, closed and total claims, respectively, as of December 31, 2011, and each of the nine prior plan year ends.

Claims By Valuation Date

| | Open Claims | | Closed | Claims | All Claims | |
|------|-------------|-------------|--------|-------------|------------|-------------|
| Plan | | Average | | Average | | Average |
| Year | Number | Net Benefit | Number | Net Benefit | Number | Net Benefit |
| 2011 | 60 | \$ 1,356 | 79 | \$ 2,247 | 139 | \$ 1,862 |
| 2010 | 50 | 1,355 | 74 | 2,098 | 124 | 1,798 |
| 2009 | 58 | 1,451 | 52 | 2,277 | 110 | 1,842 |
| 2008 | 50 | 1,319 | 64 | 2,377 | 114 | 1,913 |
| 2007 | 51 | 1,164 | 94 | 866 | 145 | 971 |
| 2006 | 62 | 1,183 | 62 | 1,170 | 124 | 1,176 |
| 2005 | 52 | 1,376 | 49 | 1,195 | 101 | 1,288 |
| 2004 | 37 | 1,368 | 47 | 1,798 | 84 | 1,609 |
| 2003 | 27 | 1,276 | 48 | 1,746 | 75 | 1,577 |
| 2002 | 34 | 1,569 | 46 | 1,299 | 80 | 1,414 |

III. Estimated Liability as of December 31, 2011

The Plan's liability for outstanding claims under the Local Income Continuation Insurance program was estimated in two parts — reported claims and incurred but unreported claims. The following paragraphs summarize the method used and results.

Reported Claims

Disabled life reserve factors were calculated using the 1987 Commissioner's Group Basic Disability table adjusted for the State of Wisconsin's own termination experience. These factors represent the present value of future payments, at 7.2% interest, to a disabled person with a monthly benefit of \$1.00. In 2010, the Employee Trust Funds Board reduced the investment return assumption relied upon by the Wisconsin Retirement System ("WRS") from 7.8% to 7.2%, which has since remained at 7.2%. For consistency, and at the direction of ETF personnel, the valuation interest rate is tied to the WRS valuation rate; therefore a 7.2% discount rate was used in the December 31, 2011, valuation. The factors are indexed by age at disablement, duration of disablement, and duration to the end of the benefit period.

Aetna provided a listing of those persons known to be disabled as of December 31, 2011. The age at disablement, duration of disability and benefit end date, based on the maximum allowable duration of benefits under the plan, was calculated for each individual. The appropriate factors were then multiplied by the amount of benefit for each disabled person. The results were summarized by year incurred and in total.

For disabilities that last over one year, an additional \$75 per month is included in the normal benefit amount for the purpose of defraying medical costs. This supplemental benefit was effective January 1, 2002, for all claims in pay status. A liability was added for those claims incurred in 2011 representing the probability that claims will continue beyond the first year and the present value of the additional benefit. The liability for the \$75 supplement is already included in the liability for claims over one year in duration.

Incurred But Unreported Claims

In addition to those claims reported as of December 31, 2011, there presumably are other claims incurred prior to that date but which are not yet reported. The Plan's liability for long-term disability claims begins on the date an employee is disabled, even though the employee is not eligible for payments during the waiting period or has not yet filed a claim. Thus, an estimate of the additional liability for claims incurred but not reported as of the valuation date is necessary.

Besides the waiting period, delays in the reporting and processing of claims normally occur. From the Plan's own experience, we observed that on average approximately 17% of claims incurred during any twelve month period are unreported as of the end of that twelve month period. Thus, the Plan's liability for claims incurred but not yet reported was calculated as the estimated number of incurred but not yet reported claims times an average liability for reported claims.

Results

The total estimated liability as of December 31, 2011, for the Local Income Continuation Insurance program is \$4,882,791, developed as follows:

| Reported Claim Liability | \$4,043,598 |
|-------------------------------------|-------------|
| <u>\$75 Supplement</u> | 35,125 |
| Total Reported Liability | 4,078,723 |
| Incurred But Not Reported Liability | 804,068 |
| Total Liability | \$4,882,791 |

This total liability is 22.3% greater than the liability determined as of December 31, 2010. The increase can be attributed primarily to a 20.0% increase in the number of open claims as well as a change in the composition and characteristics of the average claimant in the open claim cohort.

Exhibit 2 contains a breakdown of the \$4,078,723 reported liability by year of disability.

IV. Analysis of Funding Levels

The Local Income Continuation Insurance Plan continues to be in a strong financial position with assets of \$31,777,793 and estimated liabilities of \$4,882,791 which produces a net fund balance of \$26,895,001.

A reasonable long-term objective would be to maintain a net fund balance of more than 100% of the estimated liabilities as a hedge against future adverse experience. Substantial year-to-year fluctuations can occur under disability income programs, particularly for the relatively small size of this program. Maintaining a large funding balance in excess of estimated liabilities, perhaps 200% in excess, is prudent. The excess now represents 551% of the estimated liabilities. The following table shows the net fund balance as a percentage of the estimated liability by year. The table demonstrates the fluctuating, although consistently sufficient, excess funding from year to year.

| | 2011 | 2010 | 2009 | 2008 | 2007 | 2006 |
|------------------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|
| Assets | 31,777,793 | 30,457,781 | 28,097,196 | 25,871,414 | 24,150,025 | 20,919,663 |
| Estimated Liability | 4,882,791 | 3,992,238 | 3,840,102 | 3,886,827 | 3,822,315 | 4,307,964 |
| Net Fund Balance | 26,895,001 | 26,465,543 | 24,257,094 | 21,984,587 | 20,327,710 | 16,611,699 |
| Percentage | 551% | 663% | 632% | 566% | 532% | 386% |

The employer's premium contribution rate was reduced from .375% of covered payroll to .25% effective March 1, 2002. Effective 2012, all premium contributions are indefinitely waived. The \$75 Supplemental Add-on benefit was effective January 1, 2002.

Historically, the investment earnings of the plan have been large enough to fund the paid claims and administrative expenses of the plan. As a result, the assets of the plan have increased over time. Due to the continued large positive funded status of the plan, we are recommending a continuation of the waiver of premium with reinstatement when necessary pending the annual review of the plan's funded status.

Exhibit 1

 $\label{eq:Elimination Period - 90 days average. Actual waiting period can vary between 30 and 180 days.$

Benefit Period — The maximum duration of benefits for disabled insured employees is:

| Age at Disablement | Maximum Duration of Benefits in Years | | | | |
|-----------------------|--|--|--|--|--|
| 61 or Younger | To age 65 | | | | |
| 62 | 3.50 years | | | | |
| 63 | 3.00 years | | | | |
| 64 | 2.50 years | | | | |
| 65 | 2.00 years | | | | |
| 66 | 1.75 years | | | | |
| 67 | 1.50 years | | | | |
| 68 | 1.25 years | | | | |
| 69 | 1.00 years | | | | |

In no event are benefits payable beyond the 70th birthday.

Termination Rates — Deloitte Consulting completed a claim termination rate experience study using WRS disability program claims experience for claims incurred 5/13/2006 – 12/31/2010. The results of the claim termination rate study supported a reduction in the termination rate adjustment factor for the first and second year of disablement (from 280% and 260%, respectively). The percentage of the 1987 Commissioner's Basic Disability Table three month elimination period termination rates based on the State of Wisconsin's own experience are shown below:

| Duration of Disablement | Termination Rate Adjustment | | | |
|----------------------------|--------------------------------|--|--|--|
| First Year | 250% | | | |
| Second Year | 250% | | | |
| Third Year | 240% | | | |
| Fourth Year | 220% | | | |
| Fifth Year | 200% | | | |
| Sixth Year | 180% | | | |
| Seventh Year | 160% | | | |
| Eighth Year | 140% | | | |
| Ninth Year | 120% | | | |
| Tenth Year & Later | 100% | | | |

Interest – 7.2% per year.

Contingency Margins — None.

Exhibit 2

| Open Claims as of December 31, 2011 ¹ | | | | | | | | |
|--|-------|-----------|-----------|-----------|--------------|-----------|----------|--------------|
| Year of | | Gross | Offset | Net | Estimated | 75 | Ave. | Est'd |
| Disability | Count | Benefit | Amount | Benefit | Liability | Supp | Benefit | Liability |
| 2011 | 20 | \$ 51,750 | \$ 14,145 | \$ 37,605 | \$ 1,026,243 | \$ 35,125 | \$1,880 | \$ 1,061,367 |
| 2010 | 9 | 26,363 | 9,607 | 16,755 | 843,589 | | 1,862 | 843,589 |
| 2009 | 6 | 20,575 | 12,035 | 8,540 | 687,073 | | 1,423 | 687,073 |
| 2008 | 2 | 6,150 | 4,050 | 2,100 | 35,928 | | 1,050 | 35,928 |
| 2006 | 2 | 5,150 | 4,101 | 1,049 | 104,837 | | 524 | 104,837 |
| 2005 | 6 | 13,450 | 11,443 | 2,007 | 133,914 | | 334 | 133,914 |
| 2004 | 5 | 12,375 | 7,895 | 4,480 | 399,199 | | 896 | 399,199 |
| 2003 | 4 | 11,999 | 7,462 | 4,536 | 454,008 | | 1,134 | 454,008 |
| 2002 | 2 | 3,150 | 1,010 | 2,140 | 151,218 | | 1,070 | 151,218 |
| 2000 | 2 | 4,275 | 3,297 | 978 | 104,535 | | 489 | 104,535 |
| 1997 | 1 | 1,942 | 950 | 992 | 100,898 | | 992 | 100,898 |
| 1996 | 1 | 525 | 362 | 163 | 2,156 | | 163 | 2,156 |
| Total | 60 | \$157,703 | \$76,357 | \$ 81,346 | \$ 4,043,598 | \$ 35,125 | \$ 1,356 | \$ 4,078,723 |

Reported Claim Liability by Year of Disability

¹Open Claims presented by year of disability. For certain disability years (e.g. 2007, 1999, etc.), no claims remained open as of December 31, 2011.



Deloitte Consulting LLP 111 S Wacker Dr Chicago, IL 60606 United States

Tel: 312 486 2265 Fax: 312 486 2265 www.deloitte.com

About Deloitte

Deloitte refers to one or more of Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu Limited, a UK private company limited by guarantee, and its network of member firms, each of which is a legally separate and independent entity. Please see www.deloitte.com/about for a detailed description of the legal structure of Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu Limited and its member firms. Please see www.deloitte.com/us/about for a detailed description of the legal structure of Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu Limited and its member firms. Please see www.deloitte.com/us/about for a detailed description of the legal structure of Deloitte LLP and its subsidiaries. Certain services may not be available to attest clients under the rules and regulations of public accounting.

Copyright O 2012 Deloitte Development LLC. All rights reserved. Member of Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu Limited