Annual Actuarial Valuation for The State Income Continuation Insurance Plan

As of December 31, 2015

Prepared by: Daniel D. Skwire, FSA, MAAA Principal and Consulting Actuary Milliman, Inc.

> Paul L. Correia, FSA, MAAA Consulting Actuary Milliman, Inc.

April 18, 2016



This work product was prepared solely for Wisconsin ETF. It may not be appropriate to use for other purposes. Milliman does not intend to benefit and assumes no duty or liability to other parties who receive this work.

# **Table of Contents**

Certification Letter	3
Section I: Introduction and Executive Summary	6
Section II: Actuarial Valuation	8
Section III: Discussion of State ICI Funding Levels	12

## **Appendices:**

A.	Plan Description
B.	Data for Valuation
C.	Actuarial Methods and Assumptions
D.	Reliance Items





121 Middle Street, Suite 401 Portland, ME 04101-4156 USA

Tel +1 207 772 0046 Fax +1 207 772 7512

milliman.com

April 18, 2016

Ms. Deb Roemer Director of the Benefit Services Bureau Division of Retirement Services Wisconsin Department of Employee Trust Funds Madison, WI 53707

RE: Actuarial Valuation of State Income Continuation Insurance Plan as of December 31, 2015

Dear Deb:

At your request, we have performed an actuarial valuation of the State Income Continuation Insurance (ICI) Plan as of December 31, 2015. Our findings are set forth in this report.

The State of Wisconsin Department of Employee Trust Funds (ETF) has determined that the State ICI Plan is not subject to the provisions of GASB 43 or 45, which govern the financial reporting of Other Post-Employment Benefits (OPEBs), and which require the use of pension accounting methods, including the calculation of a liability for active lives. We have therefore performed this valuation according to the requirements of GASB 10 ("Accounting and Reporting for Risk Financing and Related Insurance Issues"), which does not require the calculation of a liability for active lives. This approach is consistent with prior valuation work performed on the plans. Ultimately it is the responsibility of ETF and its auditors to determine the applicable accounting standards for the plans.

This report is prepared solely for the internal business use of ETF. To the extent that Milliman's work is not subject to disclosure under applicable public records laws, Milliman's work may not be provided to third parties without Milliman's prior written consent. Milliman does not intend to benefit or create a legal duty to any third party recipient of its work product. Milliman's consent to release its work product to any third party may be conditioned on the third party signing a Release, subject to the following exceptions:

a) ETF may provide a copy of Milliman's work, in its entirety, to ETF's professional service advisors who are subject to a duty of confidentiality and



This work product was prepared solely for Wisconsin ETF. It may not be appropriate to use for other purposes. Milliman does not intend to benefit and assumes no duty or liability to other parties who receive this work.

who agree to not use Milliman's work for any purpose other than to benefit ETF.

b) ETF may provide a copy of Milliman's work, in its entirety, to other governmental entities, as required by law.

No third party recipient of Milliman's work product should rely upon Milliman's work product. Such recipients should engage qualified professionals for advice appropriate to their own specific needs.

In preparing this report, we relied, without audit, on information (some oral and some in writing) supplied by ETF, including historical claims data from Aetna and ETF. While Milliman has not audited this data, we have reviewed it for reasonableness and it is, in our opinion, sufficient and reliable for the purposes of our calculations. If any of this information as summarized in this report is inaccurate or incomplete, the results shown could be materially affected and this report may need to be revised.

The discount rate used for this valuation was prescribed by ETF and is specified in this report. We have performed no independent assessment of the reasonableness of this assumption. ETF is solely responsible for establishing the assumption and communicating any changes to Milliman for the purpose of this valuation.

This analysis is only an estimate of the Plan's financial condition as of a single date. It can neither predict the Plan's future condition nor guarantee future financial soundness. Actuarial valuations do not affect the ultimate cost of Plan benefits, only the timing of employer contributions. While this report is based on the assumptions documented here, other assumption sets may also be reasonable and valuation results based on those assumptions would be different. No one set of assumptions is uniquely correct. Determining results using alternative assumptions is outside the scope of our engagement.

Future actuarial measurements may differ significantly from the current measurements presented in this report due to such factors as the following: plan experience differing from that anticipated by the economic or demographic assumptions; changes in economic or demographic assumptions; increases or decreases expected as part of the natural operation of the methodology used for these measurements (such as the end of an amortization period); and changes in plan provisions or applicable law. Due to the limited scope of our assignment, we did not perform an analysis of the potential range of future measurements. ETF has the final decision regarding the appropriateness of the assumptions and actuarial cost methods.

The consultants who worked on this assignment are actuaries. Milliman's advice is not intended to be a substitute for qualified legal or accounting counsel.



On the basis of the foregoing, we hereby certify that, to the best of our knowledge and belief, this report is complete and accurate and has been prepared in accordance with generally recognized and accepted actuarial principles and practices.

I, Daniel D. Skwire, FSA, MAAA, am a consulting actuary for Milliman, Inc. I am a member of the American Academy of Actuaries and meet the Qualification Standards of the American Academy of Actuaries to render the actuarial opinion contained herein.

I, Paul L. Correia, FSA, MAAA, am a consulting actuary for Milliman, Inc. I am a member of the American Academy of Actuaries and meet the Qualification Standards of the American Academy of Actuaries to render the actuarial opinion contained herein.

Sincerely,

Daniel D. Skwire, FSA, MAAA Principal and Consulting Actuary Milliman, Inc.

Panlcomo

Paul L. Correia, FSA, MAAA Consulting Actuary Milliman, Inc.



# Section I: Introduction and Executive Summary

This report contains the 12/31/2015 valuation for the State Income Continuation Insurance (ICI) Plan administered by the Wisconsin Department of Employee Trust Funds (ETF).

### Summary of Actuarial Liabilities

The actuarial liabilities for the State ICI Plan as of 12/31/2015 are summarized below:

Table 1.1								
Actuarial Liabilities for the State ICI Plan as of 12/31/2015								
Liability Standard Supplemental \$75 Total Liability								
Component Benefit Benefit Add-on Amo								
Open Claims	\$73,637,666	\$1,915,237	\$408,320	\$75,961,223				
IBNR Claims	\$2,884,814	\$75,031	\$15,996	\$2,975,841				
Loss Adjustment Expense	\$3,486,784	\$90,688	\$19,334	\$3,596,806				
Total	\$80,009,264	\$2,080,956	\$443,650	\$82,533,870				

A further discussion of these actuarial liabilities, including a description of methods and assumptions, a comparison to prior year values, and an assessment of the adequacy of the liabilities, is included in the body of this report.

## Summary of Funding Analysis

As shown in the following table, the State ICI plan was in a deficit as of 12/31/2015:

	Table 1.2								
State ICI Fund Balances									
12/31/2013 12/31/2014 12/31/2015									
Beginning Balance	\$46,907,891	\$51,234,976	\$50,563,266						
Closing Adjustments	\$3,654,782	(\$185,567)	(\$161,056)						
Adjusted Beginning Balance	\$50,562,673	\$51,049,409	\$50,402,211						
Plus: Premium Contributions	\$14,985,434	\$15,746,565	\$16,788,715						
Plus: Investment Earnings	\$5,382,623	\$4,366,867	\$3,554,831						
Less: Insurance Claims	\$17,865,831	\$18,872,474	\$19,060,450						
Less: Administrative Expenses	\$1,829,922	\$1,727,102	\$1,502,539						
Ending Balance	\$51,234,976	\$50,563,266	\$50,182,768						
Actuarial Liability	\$85,563,963	\$78,817,416	\$82,533,870						
Surplus / (Deficit)	(\$34,328,987)	(\$28,254,150)	(\$32,351,102)						

According to our financial projections, which are consistent with the plan's valuation assumptions, the plan's deficit is expected to increase if the current premiums remain unchanged. In 2015, the board approved annual rate increases of 20% each year starting in



2016 until 2020. We have modeled this scenario as well as several alternate funding scenarios that are intended to improve the plan's financial position, according to our financial projections:

- Baseline: The current premiums are increased by 20% each year until 2020, then held level thereafter.
- Scenario 1: The current premiums are doubled in 2017 and remain level thereafter.
- Scenario 2: The current premiums are increased by 50% in 2017, then by another 50% in 2018, and then held level thereafter.
- Scenario 3: The current premiums are increased by 10% each year
- Scenario 4: The current premiums are increased by 5% each year

The baseline scenario is expected to eliminate the deficit by 12/31/2022, and scenarios 1 and 2 are projected to eliminate the deficit by 12/31/2020. However, the significant rate increases to participants that are involved in each of these scenarios present implications for participation rates on this voluntary program, and for potential resulting adverse selection. Scenario 3 involves more moderate rate increases of 10% per year, and is only expected to eliminate the deficit by 12/31/2025. In scenario 4, the projection does not illustrate a surplus for the plan even after 10 years of 5% annual rate increases.

Over the past several months, Milliman has performed experience studies on the State ICI plan to develop a more comprehensive understanding of the underlying risk factors. The results show that State ICI experience has varied widely among several different risk classes, such as employment category, premium category, and age. Based on these results, we believe that the optimal approach to eliminating the deficit may not necessarily be to increase rates uniformly for all plan participants. We are in the process of formulating alternative approaches to funding and managing the State ICI plan for your consideration.



This work product was prepared solely for Wisconsin ETF. It may not be appropriate to use for other purposes. Milliman does not intend to benefit and assumes no duty or liability to other parties who receive this work.

The actuarial liability for the State ICI Plan discussed in this report contains three components:

- Open Claims: The expected present value of future benefits payable to members disabled prior to the valuation date whose claims had been reported to ETF on or before that date
- Incurred but not Reported (IBNR) Claims: The expected present value of future benefits payable to members disabled prior to the valuation date, but whose claims had not yet been reported to ETF as of that date
- Loss Adjustment Expenses: The expected present value of future expenses related to the ongoing management and payment of disability claims

The following table compares the 12/31/2014 and 12/31/2015 liabilities for the State ICI plan:

Table 2.1								
Current Year and Prior Year Liabilities for the State ICI Plan								
Component	12/31/2014	12/31/2015						
Open Claims	\$72,263,687	\$75,961,223						
IBNR Claims	\$3,114,965	\$2,975,841						
Loss Adjustment Expense	\$3,438,764	\$3,596,806						
Total	\$78,817,416	\$82,533,870						

Appendix C of this report provides the detailed valuation assumptions used to compute the 12/31/2015 liabilities for the State ICI plan. A discussion of the liability components is provided below:

## **Open Claims**

The liability for open claims increased by approximately 5% due primarily to changes in claim demographics. Although the number of open claims increased only slightly from 1,221 as of 12/31/2014 to 1,222 as of 12/31/2015, the average monthly benefit amount increased by approximately 8% from \$1,264 as of 12/31/2014 to \$1,366 as of 12/31/2015.

In order to assess the adequacy of the liability for open claims, we performed a retrospective runoff test to determine whether the liabilities at prior valuation dates, estimated using the current valuation assumptions, would have been sufficient to cover the emerging costs of ICI claims. The study used State ICI claim experience from the period



Table 2.2						
Runout Study for the ICI Plans						
Claim Duration	Estimated Margin					
1-12 months	19.4%					
13-24 months	4.7%					
25 – 36 months	1.8%					
37 – 48 months	2.1%					
49 – 60 months	-1.5%					
61 + months	1.7%					
Total	5.2%					

1/1/2012 through 12/31/2015. The results shown below represent results from four mutually distinct 12-month studies that were combined.

In the preceding table, a positive margin indicates the liability was adequate to cover the runout of open disability claims during the study period, while a negative margin indicates a deficiency. The cost of the claim runout is computed as the present value of paid claims during the study period, plus the present value of the liability for these claims at the end of the study period. For this type of plan, we typically target a positive overall margin of 1% to 5%, with reasonably consistent patterns by claim duration.

The overall margin of 5.2% is slightly above our target of 1% to 5%. The margin in the first year of disability remains high, which could be because the ICI plan is used to cover short term disabilities as well as long term disabilities, and the valuation assumptions in the first year of disability may underestimate the high level of recoveries often experienced on short term disability claims. It could also be because we do not include an estimated 40.63/LTDI offset assumption in the valuation of the plan. This is an issue that we will continue to explore in future valuations.

The State ICI Plan provides an additional benefit of \$75 per month to disabled employees whose disability lasts longer than 12 months, to help these employees with medical fees. The \$75 monthly benefit is already included in the reported benefit amounts of employees disabled for 12 months or more as of the valuation date. Therefore, the additional liability for these claims was included as part of the open claim liability calculation. For employees that were disabled for fewer than 12 months as of the valuation date, the additional liability was determined using the same methods used in the open claim liability calculations. The additional liability for these claims was estimated to be \$408,320 as of 12/31/2015.

The additional liability as of 12/31/2015, including an allocation of the IBNR and loss adjustment expense liabilities, is shown below. This table also provides a split between the liabilities pertaining to standard benefits (which cover up to \$64,000 of annual earnings) and supplemental benefits (which cover annual earnings from \$64,000 to \$120,000).



Table 2.3									
Actu	Actuarial Liabilities for the State ICI Plan as of 12/31/2015								
Liability Standard Supplemental \$75 Total Liability									
Component Benefit Add-on									
Open Claims	\$73,637,666	\$1,915,237	\$408,320	\$75,961,223					
IBNR Claims	\$2,884,814	\$75,031	\$15,996	\$2,975,841					
Loss Adjustment Expense	\$3,486,784	\$90,688	\$19,334	\$3,596,806					
Total	\$80,009,264	\$2,080,956	\$443,650	\$82,533,870					

### **IBNR Claims**

The liability for IBNR claims reflects the expected portion of the total cost of claims incurred in a given year that is attributable to those claims that had not been reported as of the end of the year. If, on average, claims are reported 6 months after the date of disability, then the IBNR liability would likely be approximately 50% of the expected total cost of new claims for the year. We therefore computed the IBNR liability by estimating the total cost of incurred claims for 2015 (based on recent trends) and by using historical claim data to determine the proportion of claims that were typically unreported at each year end.

The liability for IBNR claims decreased by approximately 4% from 12/31/2014 to 12/31/2015. This was because the estimated annual incurred claims, which is calculated using historical claims experience, decreased from \$20.8 million last year to \$19.8 million this year. We continue to assume that the proportion of unreported annual claims is 15% in our IBNR liability calculations, based on an analysis of ICI claim reporting lags.

Our IBNR calculation for the State ICI plan is summarized below:

Table 2.4     Development of IBNR Liability for the State ICI Plan						
Estimated Incurred Claims	\$19,838,941					
Estimated Proportion of Unreported Claims	15.0%					
IBNR Liability as of 12/31/2015	\$2,975,841					

## Loss Adjustment Expense

The liability for loss adjustment expenses was computed by comparing the annual fees payable to Aetna, which are estimated to be \$3,405,740 in 2016, to the expected annual incurred claims amount for all three plans combined. The loss adjustment expense liability was then calculated as 4.5% of the open claim liability and 6.0% of the IBNR liability. The factor is lower for open claims than for IBNR claims because the expenses related to initial claim investigation have already been incurred and do not need to be included in the liability.



Table 2.5     Development of Loss Adjustment Expense Liability for the State ICI Plan								
Component   Liability   Expense   Loss Adjustment     Factor   Expenses   Expenses								
Open Claims	\$75,961,223	4.5%	\$3,418,255					
IBNR	\$2,975,841	6.0%	\$178,550					
Total	\$78,937,064	4.6%	\$3,596,806					

Our loss adjustment expense calculation for the State ICI plan is summarized below:



This work product was prepared solely for Wisconsin ETF. It may not be appropriate to use for other purposes. Milliman does not intend to benefit and assumes no duty or liability to other parties who receive this work.

## Section III: Discussion of State ICI Funding Levels

The actuarial valuation of the State ICI plan included an analysis of current and future funding levels. The following table shows the fund balances as of the three most recent fiscal year-ends (the 2013 values were taken from valuation reports from the prior actuary):

	Table 3.1								
State ICI Fund Balances									
12/31/2013 12/31/2014 12/31/2015									
Beginning Balance	\$46,907,891	\$51,234,976	\$50,563,266						
Closing Adjustments	\$3,654,782	(\$185,567)	(\$161,056)						
Adjusted Beginning Balance	\$50,562,673	\$51,049,409	\$50,402,211						
Plus: Premium Contributions	\$14,985,434	\$15,746,565	\$16,788,715						
Plus: Investment Earnings	\$5,382,623	\$4,366,867	\$3,554,831						
Less: Insurance Claims	\$17,865,831	\$18,872,474	\$19,060,450						
Less: Administrative Expenses	\$1,829,922	\$1,727,102	\$1,502,539						
Ending Balance	\$51,234,976	\$50,563,266	\$50,182,768						
Actuarial Liability	\$85,563,963	\$78,817,416	\$82,533,870						
Surplus / (Deficit)	(\$34,328,987)	(\$28,254,150)	(\$32,351,102)						

The State ICI plan has run a large deficit for many years. In order to evaluate the potential long-term performance of this fund, we prepared a financial projection. The projection reflects actual results for 2015 and projected values in 2016 and beyond. The key elements of this projection include the following:

- Beginning Balance: The projected beginning balance for each year is equal to the prior year's ending balance.
- Covered Payroll: The current covered payroll was provided to us by ETF. Future covered payroll is assumed to increase 3.20% per year, which is consistent with the assumptions used by ETF for retirement fund projections.
- Premium Contributions: Premiums are modeled as a percentage of covered payroll. The rate for 2016 is 0.613% based on recent experience, including the impact of a 20% increase implemented by ETF in 2016.
- Investment Income: Investment income is projected using the valuation assumption of 7.2%.
- Insurance Claims: Annual paid insurance claims are the sum of projected payments on existing claims as of 12/31/2015, and of payments on expected future claims incurred after 12/31/2015. Future incurred claims are based on historical experience of 0.65% of covered payroll in 2015, adjusted for expected aging in subsequent years.



- Administrative Expenses: Administrative expense are modeled as a constant percentage of paid insurance claims, based on actual values in 2015.
- Ending Balance: The ending balance equals the starting balance, plus premiums, plus investment earnings, less claims, and less expenses.
- Actuarial Liability: The actuarial liability is modeled in a similar fashion to the insurance claims. It represents the sum of the decreasing liability on claims that existed as of 12/31/2015, and of the increasing liability for claims incurred after 12/31/2015.
- Surplus or Deficit: The projected surplus or deficit equals the ending balance less the actuarial liability.

The current premiums for the plan, which equate to 0.613% of covered payroll, fall short of the expected annual cost of new disability claims and related administrative expenses. The magnitude of the current deficit, coupled with the mismatch between the current premiums and the annual cost of new disabilities, means that significant premium increases are required to return the plan to a fully funded status. In 2015, the board approved annual rate increases of 20% each year starting in 2016 until 2020. We have modeled this scenario as well as several alternate funding scenarios, described below:

- Baseline: The current premiums (which we estimate by using a rate of 0.613% of covered payroll) are increased by 20% each year until 2020, then held level thereafter.
- Scenario 1: The current premiums are doubled in 2017 and remain level thereafter.
- Scenario 2: The current premiums are increased by 50% in 2017, then by another 50% in 2018, and then held level thereafter.
- Scenario 3: The current premiums are increased by 10% each year.
- Scenario 4: The current premiums are increased by 5% each year.

The baseline scenario is expected to eliminate the deficit by 12/31/2022, and scenarios 1 and 2 are projected to eliminate the deficit by 12/31/2020. Please note, however, that the significant rate increases to participants in the baseline scenario and in scenarios 1 and 2, in order to restore the plan's surplus, present implications for participation rates on this voluntary program and for potential resulting adverse selection. It is likely that the long-term solution for improving the financial performance of this plan will involve items beyond just premium increases. ETF is currently evaluating the factors driving the



experience on this plan and the potential for achieving savings through plan design modifications or other measures, possibly in combination with more modest rate actions.

We have performed experience studies on the State ICI plan in order to develop a better understanding of the underlying risk factors. Because State ICI experience has varied widely among several different risk classes – such as employment category, premium category, and age – we believe that the optimal approach to eliminating the deficit may not be by increasing rates uniformly for all classes. We are formulating alternative approaches to funding and managing the plan for your consideration.

The detailed output from our baseline scenario and scenarios 1 through 4 is provided on the following pages. Please note that these projections depend on a variety of actuarial assumptions about future experience, including but not limited to investment earnings, payroll growth, and disability claim experience. It is nearly certain that actual experience will vary from these assumptions, meaning that the plan's actual surplus or deficit will be higher or lower than the illustrated values.



Calendar Year	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024
BOY Fund Balance	\$50,402,211	\$50,182,768	\$51,875,991	\$57,576,757	\$68,674,887	\$85,636,905	\$110,577,533	\$136,850,047	\$164,501,315	\$193,881,252
Premium Contributions	\$16,788,715	\$19,376,865	\$23,996,310	\$29,717,030	\$36,801,571	\$45,575,065	\$47,033,467	\$48,538,538	\$50,091,771	\$51,694,708
Investment Income	\$3,554,831	\$3,613,159	\$3,735,071	\$4,145,527	\$4,944,592	\$6,165,857	\$7,961,582	\$9,853,203	\$11,844,095	\$13,959,450
Total Revenues	\$20,343,546	\$22,990,025	\$27,731,381	\$33,862,557	\$41,746,162	\$51,740,922	\$54,995,049	\$58,391,741	\$61,935,866	\$65,654,158
Insurance Claims	\$19,060,450	\$19,740,643	\$20,420,836	\$21,101,029	\$22,973,165	\$24,841,995	\$26,623,778	\$28,494,265	\$30,177,065	\$31,974,510
Carrier Administrative Expenses	\$1,258,495	\$1,303,406	\$1,348,317	\$1,393,227	\$1,516,838	\$1,640,230	\$1,757,875	\$1,881,377	\$1,992,486	\$2,111,165
Administrative Expense	\$244,044	\$252,753	\$261,462	\$270,171	\$294,141	\$318,069	\$340,882	\$364,832	\$386,378	\$409,391
Total Operating Expenses	\$20,562,989	\$21,296,802	\$22,030,615	\$22,764,427	\$24,784,144	\$26,800,294	\$28,722,535	\$30,740,473	\$32,555,929	\$34,495,067
Net Change in Fund Balance	(\$219,443)	\$1,693,223	\$5,700,767	\$11,098,130	\$16,962,018	\$24,940,628	\$26,272,514	\$27,651,268	\$29,379,937	\$31,159,091
EOY Fund Balance	\$50,182,768	\$51,875,991	\$57,576,757	\$68,674,887	\$85,636,905	\$110,577,533	\$136,850,047	\$164,501,315	\$193,881,252	\$225,040,343
Incurred Claim Liability	\$82,533,870	\$94,507,411	\$104,939,581	\$114,497,013	\$123,551,634	\$132,167,672	\$140,489,961	\$148,534,512	\$156,387,373	\$164,146,257
Surplus / (Deficit)	(\$32,351,102)	(\$42,631,421)	(\$47,362,824)	(\$45,822,126)	(\$37,914,729)	(\$21,590,139)	(\$3,639,914)	\$15,966,803	\$37,493,879	\$60,894,087

Baseline: Increase contribution rate by 20% each year until 2020, then hold level at 1.272%



Calendar Year	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024
BOY Fund Balance	\$50,402,211	\$50,182,768	\$51,875,991	\$73,574,297	\$97,380,873	\$122,202,562	\$148,158,283	\$175,467,214	\$204,176,099	\$234,634,672
Premium Contributions	\$16,788,715	\$19,376,865	\$39,993,850	\$41,273,653	\$42,594,410	\$43,957,431	\$45,364,069	\$46,815,719	\$48,313,823	\$49,859,865
Investment Income	\$3,554,831	\$3,613,159	\$3,735,071	\$5,297,349	\$7,011,423	\$8,798,584	\$10,667,396	\$12,633,639	\$14,700,679	\$16,893,696
Total Revenues	\$20,343,546	\$22,990,025	\$43,728,922	\$46,571,003	\$49,605,833	\$52,756,016	\$56,031,466	\$59,449,359	\$63,014,502	\$66,753,561
Insurance Claims	\$19,060,450	\$19,740,643	\$20,420,836	\$21,101,029	\$22,973,165	\$24,841,995	\$26,623,778	\$28,494,265	\$30,177,065	\$31,974,510
Carrier Administrative Expenses	\$1,258,495	\$1,303,406	\$1,348,317	\$1,393,227	\$1,516,838	\$1,640,230	\$1,757,875	\$1,881,377	\$1,992,486	\$2,111,165
Administrative Expense	\$244,044	\$252,753	\$261,462	\$270,171	\$294,141	\$318,069	\$340,882	\$364,832	\$386,378	\$409,391
Total Operating Expenses	\$20,562,989	\$21,296,802	\$22,030,615	\$22,764,427	\$24,784,144	\$26,800,294	\$28,722,535	\$30,740,473	\$32,555,929	\$34,495,067
Net Change in Fund Balance	(\$219,443)	\$1,693,223	\$21,698,307	\$23,806,575	\$24,821,689	\$25,955,722	\$27,308,930	\$28,708,886	\$30,458,573	\$32,258,495
EOY Fund Balance	\$50,182,768	\$51,875,991	\$73,574,297	\$97,380,873	\$122,202,562	\$148,158,283	\$175,467,214	\$204,176,099	\$234,634,672	\$266,893,167
Incurred Claim Liability	\$82,533,870	\$94,507,411	\$104,939,581	\$114,497,013	\$123,551,634	\$132,167,672	\$140,489,961	\$148,534,512	\$156,387,373	\$164,146,257
Surplus / (Deficit)	(\$32,351,102)	(\$42,631,421)	(\$31,365,283)	(\$17,116,140)	(\$1,349,072)	\$15,990,612	\$34,977,253	\$55,641,587	\$78,247,299	\$102,746,910

Scenario 1: Double contribution rate to 1.226% in 2017 and hold level at that rate



Calendar Year	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024
BOY Fund Balance	\$50,402,211	\$50,182,768	\$51,875,991	\$63,575,835	\$91,821,728	\$121,567,459	\$152,972,133	\$186,298,169	\$221,638,848	\$259,393,966
Premium Contributions	\$16,788,715	\$19,376,865	\$29,995,388	\$46,432,860	\$47,918,712	\$49,452,110	\$51,034,578	\$52,667,684	\$54,353,050	\$56,092,348
Investment Income	\$3,554,831	\$3,613,159	\$3,735,071	\$4,577,460	\$6,611,164	\$8,752,857	\$11,013,994	\$13,413,468	\$15,957,997	\$18,676,366
Total Revenues	\$20,343,546	\$22,990,025	\$33,730,459	\$51,010,320	\$54,529,876	\$58,204,967	\$62,048,571	\$66,081,153	\$70,311,047	\$74,768,714
Insurance Claims	\$19,060,450	\$19,740,643	\$20,420,836	\$21,101,029	\$22,973,165	\$24,841,995	\$26,623,778	\$28,494,265	\$30,177,065	\$31,974,510
Carrier Administrative Expenses	\$1,258,495	\$1,303,406	\$1,348,317	\$1,393,227	\$1,516,838	\$1,640,230	\$1,757,875	\$1,881,377	\$1,992,486	\$2,111,165
Administrative Expense	\$244,044	\$252,753	\$261,462	\$270,171	\$294,141	\$318,069	\$340,882	\$364,832	\$386,378	\$409,391
Total Operating Expenses	\$20,562,989	\$21,296,802	\$22,030,615	\$22,764,427	\$24,784,144	\$26,800,294	\$28,722,535	\$30,740,473	\$32,555,929	\$34,495,067
Net Change in Fund Balance	(\$219,443)	\$1,693,223	\$11,699,844	\$28,245,893	\$29,745,732	\$31,404,673	\$33,326,036	\$35,340,679	\$37,755,118	\$40,273,647
EOY Fund Balance	\$50,182,768	\$51,875,991	\$63,575,835	\$91,821,728	\$121,567,459	\$152,972,133	\$186,298,169	\$221,638,848	\$259,393,966	\$299,667,613
Incurred Claim Liability	\$82,533,870	\$94,507,411	\$104,939,581	\$114,497,013	\$123,551,634	\$132,167,672	\$140,489,961	\$148,534,512	\$156,387,373	\$164,146,257
Surplus / (Deficit)	(\$32,351,102)	(\$42,631,421)	(\$41,363,746)	(\$22,675,285)	(\$1,984,174)	\$20,804,461	\$45,808,208	\$73,104,336	\$103,006,593	\$135,521,357

Scenario 2: Increase contribution rate by 50% in 2017 and 2018, then hold level at 1.380%



Scenario 3: Increase contribution rate by 10% each year

Calendar Year	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024
BOY Fund Balance	\$50,402,211	\$50,182,768	\$51,875,991	\$55,577,065	\$61,784,747	\$69,795,684	\$80,199,717	\$93,781,205	\$111,261,429	\$133,791,309
Premium Contributions	\$16,788,715	\$19,376,865	\$21,996,618	\$24,970,560	\$28,346,580	\$32,179,038	\$36,529,644	\$41,468,451	\$47,074,986	\$53,439,524
Investment Income	\$3,554,831	\$3,613,159	\$3,735,071	\$4,001,549	\$4,448,502	\$5,025,289	\$5,774,380	\$6,752,247	\$8,010,823	\$9,632,974
Total Revenues	\$20,343,546	\$22,990,025	\$25,731,689	\$28,972,109	\$32,795,082	\$37,204,327	\$42,304,023	\$48,220,698	\$55,085,809	\$63,072,498
Insurance Claims	\$19,060,450	\$19,740,643	\$20,420,836	\$21,101,029	\$22,973,165	\$24,841,995	\$26,623,778	\$28,494,265	\$30,177,065	\$31,974,510
Carrier Administrative Expenses	\$1,258,495	\$1,303,406	\$1,348,317	\$1,393,227	\$1,516,838	\$1,640,230	\$1,757,875	\$1,881,377	\$1,992,486	\$2,111,165
Administrative Expense	\$244,044	\$252,753	\$261,462	\$270,171	\$294,141	\$318,069	\$340,882	\$364,832	\$386,378	\$409,391
Total Operating Expenses	\$20,562,989	\$21,296,802	\$22,030,615	\$22,764,427	\$24,784,144	\$26,800,294	\$28,722,535	\$30,740,473	\$32,555,929	\$34,495,067
Net Change in Fund Balance	(\$219,443)	\$1,693,223	\$3,701,074	\$6,207,682	\$8,010,937	\$10,404,033	\$13,581,488	\$17,480,225	\$22,529,880	\$28,577,432
EOY Fund Balance	\$50,182,768	\$51,875,991	\$55,577,065	\$61,784,747	\$69,795,684	\$80,199,717	\$93,781,205	\$111,261,429	\$133,791,309	\$162,368,741
Incurred Claim Liability	\$82,533,870	\$94,507,411	\$104,939,581	\$114,497,013	\$123,551,634	\$132,167,672	\$140,489,961	\$148,534,512	\$156,387,373	\$164,146,257
Surplus / (Deficit)	(\$32,351,102)	(\$42,631,421)	(\$49,362,516)	(\$52,712,266)	(\$53,755,950)	(\$51,967,955)	(\$46,708,756)	(\$37,273,083)	(\$22,596,064)	(\$1,777,516)



Scenario 4: Increase contribution rate by 5% each year

	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024
\$50,402,211	\$50,182,768	\$51,875,991	\$54,577,219	\$58,494,452	\$62,576,086	\$66,996,536	\$72,046,414	\$77,862,053	\$84,903,392
\$16,788,715	\$19,376,865	\$20,996,771	\$22,752,101	\$24,654,177	\$26,715,266	\$28,948,663	\$31,368,771	\$33,991,200	\$36,832,864
\$3,554,831	\$3,613,159	\$3,735,071	\$3,929,560	\$4,211,601	\$4,505,478	\$4,823,751	\$5,187,342	\$5,606,068	\$6,113,044
\$20,343,546	\$22,990,025	\$24,731,843	\$26,681,661	\$28,865,778	\$31,220,745	\$33,772,413	\$36,556,113	\$39,597,268	\$42,945,909
\$19,060,450	\$19,740,643	\$20,420,836	\$21,101,029	\$22,973,165	\$24,841,995	\$26,623,778	\$28,494,265	\$30,177,065	\$31,974,510
\$1,258,495	\$1,303,406	\$1,348,317	\$1,393,227	\$1,516,838	\$1,640,230	\$1,757,875	\$1,881,377	\$1,992,486	\$2,111,165
\$244,044	\$252,753	\$261,462	\$270,171	\$294,141	\$318,069	\$340,882	\$364,832	\$386,378	\$409,391
\$20,562,989	\$21,296,802	\$22,030,615	\$22,764,427	\$24,784,144	\$26,800,294	\$28,722,535	\$30,740,473	\$32,555,929	\$34,495,067
(\$219,443)	\$1,693,223	\$2,701,228	\$3,917,234	\$4,081,633	\$4,420,450	\$5,049,878	\$5,815,639	\$7,041,339	\$8,450,842
\$50,182,768	\$51,875,991	\$54,577,219	\$58,494,452	\$62,576,086	\$66,996,536	\$72,046,414	\$77,862,053	\$84,903,392	\$93,354,234
\$82,533,870	\$94,507,411	\$104,939,581	\$114,497,013	\$123,551,634	\$132,167,672	\$140,489,961	\$148,534,512	\$156,387,373	\$164,146,257
(\$32,351,102)	(\$42,631,421)	(\$50,362,362)	(\$56,002,561)	(\$60,975,548)	(\$65,171,136)	(\$68,443,547)	(\$70,672,459)	(\$71,483,981)	(\$70,792,023)
	\$16,788,715 \$3,554,831 \$20,343,546 \$19,060,450 \$1,258,495 \$244,044 \$20,562,989 (\$219,443) \$50,182,768 \$82,533,870	\$16,788,715 \$19,376,865   \$3,554,831 \$3,613,159   \$20,343,546 \$22,990,025   \$19,060,450 \$19,740,643   \$1,258,495 \$1,303,406   \$244,044 \$252,753   \$20,562,989 \$21,296,802   (\$219,443) \$1,693,223   \$50,182,768 \$51,875,991   \$82,533,870 \$94,507,411	\$16,788,715 \$19,376,865 \$20,996,771   \$3,554,831 \$3,613,159 \$3,735,071   \$20,343,546 \$22,990,025 \$24,731,843   \$19,060,450 \$19,740,643 \$20,420,836   \$1,258,495 \$1,303,406 \$1,348,317   \$244,044 \$252,753 \$261,462   \$20,562,989 \$21,296,802 \$22,030,615   (\$219,443) \$1,693,223 \$2,701,228   \$50,182,768 \$51,875,991 \$54,577,219   \$82,533,870 \$94,507,411 \$104,939,581	\$16,788,715 \$19,376,865 \$20,996,771 \$22,752,101   \$3,554,831 \$3,613,159 \$3,735,071 \$3,929,560   \$20,343,546 \$22,990,025 \$24,731,843 \$26,681,661   \$19,060,450 \$19,740,643 \$20,420,836 \$21,101,029   \$1,258,495 \$1,303,406 \$1,348,317 \$1,393,227   \$244,044 \$252,753 \$261,462 \$270,171   \$20,562,989 \$21,296,802 \$22,030,615 \$22,764,427   (\$219,443) \$1,693,223 \$2,701,228 \$3,917,234   \$50,182,768 \$51,875,991 \$54,577,219 \$58,494,452   \$82,533,870 \$94,507,411 \$104,939,581 \$114,497,013	\$16,788,715\$19,376,865\$20,996,771\$22,752,101\$24,654,177\$3,554,831\$3,613,159\$3,735,071\$3,929,560\$4,211,601\$20,343,546\$22,990,025\$24,731,843\$26,681,661\$28,865,778\$19,060,450\$19,740,643\$20,420,836\$21,101,029\$22,973,165\$1,258,495\$1,303,406\$1,348,317\$1,393,227\$1,516,838\$244,044\$252,753\$261,462\$270,171\$294,141\$20,562,989\$21,296,802\$22,030,615\$22,764,427\$24,784,144(\$219,443)\$1,693,223\$2,701,228\$3,917,234\$4,081,633\$50,182,768\$51,875,991\$54,577,219\$58,494,452\$62,576,086\$82,533,870\$94,507,411\$104,939,581\$114,497,013\$123,551,634	\$16,788,715\$19,376,865\$20,996,771\$22,752,101\$24,654,177\$26,715,266\$3,554,831\$3,613,159\$3,735,071\$3,929,560\$4,211,601\$4,505,478\$20,343,546\$22,990,025\$24,731,843\$26,681,661\$28,865,778\$31,220,745\$19,060,450\$19,740,643\$20,420,836\$21,101,029\$22,973,165\$24,841,995\$1,258,495\$1,303,406\$11,348,317\$1,393,227\$1,516,838\$1,640,230\$244,044\$252,753\$261,462\$270,171\$294,141\$318,069\$20,562,989\$21,296,802\$22,030,615\$22,764,427\$24,784,144\$26,800,294(\$219,443)\$1,693,223\$2,701,228\$3,917,234\$4,081,633\$4,420,450\$50,182,768\$51,875,991\$54,577,219\$58,494,452\$62,576,086\$66,996,536\$82,533,870\$94,507,411\$104,939,581\$114,497,013\$123,551,634\$132,167,672	\$16,788,715 \$19,376,865 \$20,996,771 \$22,752,101 \$24,654,177 \$26,715,266 \$28,948,663   \$3,554,831 \$3,613,159 \$3,735,071 \$3,929,560 \$4,211,601 \$4,505,478 \$4,823,751   \$20,343,546 \$22,990,025 \$24,731,843 \$26,681,661 \$28,865,778 \$31,220,745 \$33,772,413   \$19,060,450 \$19,740,643 \$20,420,836 \$21,101,029 \$22,973,165 \$24,841,995 \$26,623,778   \$1,258,495 \$1,303,406 \$1,348,317 \$1,393,227 \$1,516,838 \$1,640,230 \$1,757,875   \$244,044 \$252,753 \$261,462 \$270,171 \$294,141 \$318,069 \$340,882   \$20,562,989 \$21,296,802 \$22,030,615 \$22,764,427 \$24,784,144 \$26,800,294 \$28,722,535   (\$219,443) \$1,693,223 \$2,701,228 \$3,917,234 \$4,081,633 \$4,420,450 \$5,049,878   \$50,182,768 \$51,875,991 \$54,577,219 \$58,494,452 \$62,576,086 \$66,996,536 \$72,046,414   \$82,533,870 \$94,507,411 \$104,939,581 \$114,497,013 \$123,551,634 \$132,167,672 \$140,489,961	\$16,788,715 \$19,376,865 \$20,996,771 \$22,752,101 \$24,654,177 \$26,715,266 \$28,948,663 \$31,368,771   \$3,554,831 \$3,613,159 \$3,735,071 \$3,929,560 \$4,211,601 \$4,505,478 \$4,823,751 \$5,187,342   \$20,343,546 \$22,990,025 \$24,731,843 \$26,681,661 \$28,865,778 \$31,220,745 \$33,772,413 \$36,556,113   \$19,060,450 \$19,740,643 \$20,420,836 \$21,101,029 \$22,973,165 \$24,841,995 \$26,623,778 \$28,494,265   \$1,258,495 \$1,303,406 \$1,348,317 \$1,393,227 \$1,516,838 \$1,640,230 \$1,757,875 \$1,881,377   \$244,044 \$252,753 \$261,462 \$270,171 \$294,141 \$318,069 \$340,882 \$364,832   \$20,562,989 \$21,296,802 \$22,701,228 \$3,917,234 \$4,081,633 \$4,420,450 \$5,049,878 \$5,815,639   \$50,182,768 \$51,875,991 \$54,577,219 \$58,494,452 \$62,576,086 \$66,996,536 \$72,046,414 \$77,862,053   \$82,533,870 \$94,507,411 \$104,939,581 \$114,497,013 \$123,551,634 \$132,167,672 \$140,489,961 </td <td>\$16,788,715 \$19,376,865 \$20,996,771 \$22,752,101 \$24,654,177 \$26,715,266 \$28,948,663 \$31,368,771 \$33,991,200   \$3,554,831 \$3,613,159 \$3,735,071 \$3,929,560 \$4,211,601 \$4,505,478 \$4,823,751 \$5,187,342 \$5,606,068   \$20,343,546 \$22,990,025 \$24,731,843 \$26,681,661 \$28,865,778 \$31,220,745 \$33,772,413 \$36,556,113 \$39,597,268   \$19,060,450 \$19,740,643 \$20,420,836 \$21,101,029 \$22,973,165 \$24,841,995 \$26,623,778 \$28,494,265 \$30,177,065   \$1,258,495 \$1,303,406 \$1,348,317 \$1,393,227 \$1,516,838 \$1,640,230 \$1,757,875 \$1,881,377 \$1,992,486   \$24,40,44 \$252,753 \$261,462 \$270,171 \$294,141 \$318,069 \$340,882 \$364,832 \$386,378   \$20,562,989 \$21,296,802 \$22,701,228 \$3,917,234 \$4,081,633 \$4,420,450 \$5,049,878 \$5,815,639 \$7,041,339   \$50,182,768 \$51,875,991 \$54,577,219 \$58,494,452 \$62,576,086 \$66,996,536 \$72,046,414 \$77,862,053 \$84,903,392</td>	\$16,788,715 \$19,376,865 \$20,996,771 \$22,752,101 \$24,654,177 \$26,715,266 \$28,948,663 \$31,368,771 \$33,991,200   \$3,554,831 \$3,613,159 \$3,735,071 \$3,929,560 \$4,211,601 \$4,505,478 \$4,823,751 \$5,187,342 \$5,606,068   \$20,343,546 \$22,990,025 \$24,731,843 \$26,681,661 \$28,865,778 \$31,220,745 \$33,772,413 \$36,556,113 \$39,597,268   \$19,060,450 \$19,740,643 \$20,420,836 \$21,101,029 \$22,973,165 \$24,841,995 \$26,623,778 \$28,494,265 \$30,177,065   \$1,258,495 \$1,303,406 \$1,348,317 \$1,393,227 \$1,516,838 \$1,640,230 \$1,757,875 \$1,881,377 \$1,992,486   \$24,40,44 \$252,753 \$261,462 \$270,171 \$294,141 \$318,069 \$340,882 \$364,832 \$386,378   \$20,562,989 \$21,296,802 \$22,701,228 \$3,917,234 \$4,081,633 \$4,420,450 \$5,049,878 \$5,815,639 \$7,041,339   \$50,182,768 \$51,875,991 \$54,577,219 \$58,494,452 \$62,576,086 \$66,996,536 \$72,046,414 \$77,862,053 \$84,903,392



## Appendix A: Plan Description

The State ICI Plan provides short and long term disability benefits as summarized below:

- Elimination Period: University of Wisconsin employees select their elimination period up to 180 days. All other state employees have a 30-day elimination period. State ICI participants must use sick leave time up to a maximum of 130 working days before benefits begin.
- Maximum Benefit Period: The following table shows the maximum duration of benefits:

Age at Disablement	Maximum Benefit Period
Before age 62	To age 65
62	3.50 years
63	3.00 years
64	2.50 years
65	2.00 years
66	1.75 years
67	1.50 years
68	1.25 years
69	To Age 70

- Benefit Amount: The Standard benefit provides up to 75% of a participant's average monthly earnings, capped at \$4,000 per month. Supplemental Coverage is available to employees whose annual salary exceeds \$64,000, and provides an additional benefit up to \$3,500 per month.
- Benefit Increases: None
- Benefit Offsets: The ICI plan benefit is offset by income received from other sources including, but not limited to: Social Security (regular or disability), unemployment compensation, worker's compensation (except permanent disability awards), WRS benefits (retirement, disability retirement, Long Term Disability Insurance, or separation), work earnings, and Duty Disability benefits.
- Definition of Disability: During the first 12 months of disability, the participant is disabled if unable to perform his or her job and under the care of a physician. After the first 12 months of disability, the participant is disabled if unable to engage in any substantial gainful activity for which he or she is reasonably qualified.



• Premium Contributions: Premiums for Standard Coverage are paid by the employer and the employee. Premiums for Supplemental Coverage are paid entirely by the employee.



## **Appendix B: Data for Valuation**

Number of Active State ICI Claims by Year of Disability as of December 31, 2015						
Year of Disability	Male	Female	Total			
2001 and earlier	39	91	130			
2002	7	18	25			
2003	6	24	30			
2004	10	28	38			
2005	9	35	44			
2006	17	27	44			
2007	23	28	51			
2008	18	30	48			
2009	21	36	57			
2010	23	43	66			
2011	19	51	70			
2012	32	62	94			
2013	41	84	125			
2014	36	75	111			
2015	90	199	289			
Total	391	831	1,222			

	<b>Total Net Monthly Benefit by Year of Disability</b> as of December 31, 2015						
Year of Disability	Male	Female	Total				
2001 and earlier	\$29,174	\$66,207	\$95,381				
2002	\$5,629	\$12,245	\$17,874				
2003	\$1,468	\$17,257	\$18,725				
2004	\$7,762	\$21,253	\$29,016				
2005	\$6,474	\$33,342	\$39,816				
2006	\$15,829	\$21,066	\$36,895				
2007	\$17,663	\$31,699	\$49,362				
2008	\$11,763	\$22,617	\$34,380				
2009	\$13,815	\$41,440	\$55,255				
2010	\$24,640	\$45,166	\$69,806				
2011	\$17,210	\$38,756	\$55,966				
2012	\$33,944	\$74,931	\$108,875				
2013	\$54,263	\$98,577	\$152,839				
2014	\$48,976	\$144,880	\$193,857				
2015	\$220,115	\$490,728	\$710,843				
Total	\$508,725	\$1,160,165	\$1,668,890				



Number of Active State ICI Claims by Age at Disability								
	as of December 31, 2015							
Year of Disability	Male	Female	Total					
< 20	0	0	0					
20-24	7	14	21					
25-29	6	34	40					
30-34	30	61	91					
35-39	45	127	172					
40-44	65	153	218					
45-49	82	126	208					
50-54	83	156	239					
55-59	51	116	167					
60-64	22	41	63					
65+	0	3	3					
Total	391	831	1,222					

Total Net Monthly Benefit by Age at Disability								
as	as of December 31, 2015							
Age at Disability	Male	Female	Total					
< 20	\$0	\$0	\$0					
20-24	\$10,091	\$19,385	\$29,476					
25-29	\$8,374	\$46,067	\$54,441					
30-34	\$46,936	\$97,519	\$144,455					
35-39	\$58,818	\$185,001	\$243,819					
40-44	\$91,012	\$202,194	\$293,206					
45-49	\$104,800	\$171,986	\$276,786					
50-54	\$94,272	\$191,291	\$285,563					
55-59	\$60,156	\$170,341	\$230,497					
60-64	\$34,267	\$72,920	\$107,187					
65+	\$0	\$3,459	\$3,459					
Total	\$508,725	\$1,160,165	\$1,668,890					



## Appendix C: Actuarial Methods and Assumptions

- Valuation Date: 12/31/2015
- Discount Rate: 7.20%, specified by ETF
- Claim Termination Rates: Claim termination rate assumptions were derived from 1987 CGDT rates using the following adjustment factors:

Disability Duration	Termination Rate Adjustment Factor
1-24 months	2.50
25 – 36 months	2.40
37 – 48 months	2.20
49 – 60 months	2.00
61 – 72 months	1.80
73 – 84 months	1.60
85 – 96 months	1.40
97 – 108 months	1.20
109 + months	1.00

• Future Offset Approval Rates: Estimated Social Security offset assumptions are shown below. No future offsets are assumed on claimants disabled more than five years.

Probability of being approved for Social Security benefits (if not already approved):

Claim Duration	Probability
1-12 months	69%
13-24 months	45%
25 - 36 months	17%
37 - 48 months	8%
49 – 60 months	5%
61 + months	0%

Future Social Security offset amount as percentage of gross benefit amount: 44%.

- Incurred But Not Reported Claims: 15% of the estimated incurred claims for the current year, as determined from analyses of historical State ICI claims experience.
- Loss Adjustment Expenses: 4.5% of the liability for open claims plus 6.0% of the liability for IBNR claims.



### Appendix D: Reliance Items

In performing the valuation, we relied, without audit, on certain data and information provided by ETF and Aetna. To the extent any of the data or other items was incomplete or inaccurate, the results of our work may be materially affected.

The principal items on which we relied included the following:

- Lists of active disability claims and related information provided by Aetna
- Asset balances, premium contributions, plan expenses, covered payroll, and other financial information provided by ETF
- Plan descriptions provided by ETF
- Discussions with ETF and Aetna personnel

